Sample Task #1

In drawing the unit to a close, we actively teach both the Integrated approach, which is an essay sectioned by 'big ideas'; and then the Block style, which is the method broken into a text-based and more sequential analysis, of a Comparative Essay. We use an accessible prompt, such as:

Write a comparative response to the topic below. You must plan your response carefully and your ideas must be supported by appropriate, specific references from both texts.

Prompt: Both 'The Giver' and 'The Truman Show' explore how individuals are controlled by society.

As this is the student's first attempt at a comparative essay, at this Year 8 level we heavily scaffold the ideas and structure with students, for them to feel confident and successful in their response. A suggested approach may be as follows.

Integrated approach

The integrated approach would break the texts down into it's 'big ideas' in response to the topic and incorporate both texts into each discussion. A possible structure can be seen below:

Big idea one: Both texts show that individuals are controlled socially. *The Giver* arranges families into groups with intention, and similarly, *The Truman Show* does not present authentic families, but rather paid actors are featured on the 'show' of Truman.

Big idea two: The communities presented are shown as being under careful surveillance of those in power, and Christof in fact reminds us that '(he) is the Creator' of all that we see. Similarly, the Elders of *The Giver* have the power to provide messages over the public announcement system, such as when Lily forgot to tie her hair ribbons, or Jonas took the apple to check for something strange; the colour that he had recognised.

Big idea three: both texts give a world view that is devoid of personal choice. Both communities assign individuals to a particular job, and furthermore, Truman's community is nothing but a sea of paid actors. The citizens of Jonas' world are 'assigned' positions when they 'become a twelve', and this then restricts them to that given role, for life.

Block style

The Block approach to a comparative essay takes each text separately and breaks the topic down from here. A suggestion may be:

Paragraph one: *The Giver* shows us how individuals are controlled by society on a social level. Jonas' community is arranged into families, and people are assigned professions.

Paragraph two: Lowry presents a world ruled by structure, and this relies heavily on surveillance and compliance. The Elders are able to make 'announcements' over the public speaker system, in order to provide behavioural reminders to the community as a form of control.

Paragraph three: Similarly, *The Truman Show* exposes a world devoid of personal choice, and in fact Truman is so heavily manipulated that he is completely unaware that he 'is the star' of his own life's show.